arXiv:1102.2916v1 [math.GT] 14 Feb 2011

A Counterexample to a Conjecture about Positive Scalar Curvature

Daniel Pape* Thomas Schick†
Georg-August-Universität Göttingen
Bunsenstr. 3, 37073 Göttingen, Germany
`pape@uni-math.gwdg.de` `schick@uni-math.gwdg.de`

Feb 1, 2011

Abstract

[1, Conjecture 1] asserts that a closed smooth manifold M with non-spin universal covering admits a metric of positive scalar curvature if and only if a certain homological condition is satisfied. We present a counterexample to this conjecture, based on the counterexample to the unstable Gromov-Lawson-Rosenberg conjecture given in [4].

1 The Result

We give a counterexample to the following conjecture stated by Chang as [1, Conjecture 1], and attributed there to Rosenberg and Weinberger.

Conjecture 1.1. *Suppose that M is a compact oriented manifold such that the universal covering does not admit a spin structure, with fundamental group Γ and of dimension $n \geq 5$. Let $f\colon M \to \underline{B}\Gamma$ be the composition of the classifying map $c\colon M \to B\Gamma$ of the universal covering of M, and the natural map $B\Gamma \to \underline{B}\Gamma$. Denote by $[M]$ the fundamental class of M in $H_n(M)$. Then M admits a metric of positive scalar curvature if and only if $f_*[M]$ vanishes in $H_n(\underline{B}\Gamma)$.*

Here $B\Gamma$ is the classifying space for the group Γ and $\underline{B}\Gamma$ is the classifying space for proper actions, i.e. the quotient $\underline{E}\Gamma/\Gamma$, where $\underline{E}\Gamma$ is a proper Γ-space such that for every finite subgroup $F \leq \Gamma$ the fixed point set $\underline{E}\Gamma^F$ is contractible (in particular, non-empty), but such that $\underline{E}\Gamma^H = \emptyset$ for all other subgroups $H \leq \Gamma$, compare [1, p. 1623].

Our counterexample is based on the counterexample to the Gromov-Lawson-Rosenberg conjecture given in [4]. There, a 5-dimensional connected closed spin manifold M with fundamental group $\Gamma = \mathbb{Z}^4 \oplus \mathbb{Z}/3$ is constructed, whose Rosenberg index vanishes but which nevertheless does not admit a metric of positive scalar curvature. By taking the connected sum of this manifold M with a simply-connected non-spin manifold N, we obtain a totally non-spin manifold X which has the same fundamental group as M. One has $B\Gamma = \mathbb{T}^4 \times B\mathbb{Z}/3$ and analogously $\underline{B}\Gamma = \mathbb{T}^4$ by [1, (1) and (4), p. 1624]. Especially, $H_n(\underline{B}\Gamma) = 0$ for $n \geq 5$, so that the condition

---

[*] the author was supported by the German Research Foundation (DFG) through the Research Training Group 1493 'Mathematical structures in modern quantum physics'. `www.uni-math.gwdg.de/pape`

[†] partially funded by the Courant Research Center 'Higher order structures in Mathematics' within the German initiative of excellence. `www.uni-math.gwdg.de/schick`

on $f_*[X]$ from Conjecture 1.1 is satisfied in the case at hand. The argument in [4] relies on the following observation by Stolz and we will also make significant use of this result.

Lemma 1.1. *Let X be a topological space and set for $n \in \mathbb{N}_{\geq 2}$*

$$H_n^+(X) := \{f_*[M] \in H_n(X)\,;\, f\colon M^n \to X \text{ and } M \text{ admits a metric with scal} > 0\}$$

Then for any class $u \in H^1(X)$ the map

$$u \cap \ : H_n(X) \to H_{n-1}(X) \quad , \quad x \mapsto u \cap x$$

maps $H_n^+(X)$ into $H_{n-1}^+(X)$ if $3 \leq n \leq 8$.

Proof. See [4, Corollary 1.5] for $3 \leq n \leq 7$ and [2, Theorem 4.4] for $n = 8$. ☐

Our result reads now as follows.

Proposition 1.2. *Let M be the manifold constructed in [4] (we recall its construction in Section 2) and N a simply connected manifold of dimension 5 which admits no spin structure. Then the manifold $X := M\#N$ has non-spin universal covering and admits no metric with positive scalar curvature.*

This result is part of the first named author's forthcoming thesis [3].

2 The Proof

Proof of Proposition 1.2. First of all, if X is constructed as above, we have already noted that it has non-spin universal covering. To obtain an explicit simply-connected non-spin 5-manifold N, one can start with $\mathbb{C}P^2 \times S^1$, which is non-spin as $\mathbb{C}P^2$ is, and then do surgery on the embedded S^1 to obtain the simply-connected N. Because this surgery does not touch the embedded $\mathbb{C}P^1$ with its non-spin normal bundle, the resulting N remains a non-spin manifold.

In order to see that X admits no metric of positive scalar curvature, we use the same argument as in [4]. To begin with, we choose the model $B\Gamma = \mathbb{T}^4 \times B\mathbb{Z}/3$. Recall,

$$H_n(\mathbb{T}^d) = \mathbb{Z}^{d(n)} \quad , \quad d(n) = \binom{d}{n}$$

and

$$H_n(B\mathbb{Z}/k) = H_n(\mathbb{Z}/k) = \begin{cases} \mathbb{Z}, & n = 0; \\ \mathbb{Z}/k, & n \text{ odd}; \\ 0, & n \text{ even}. \end{cases}$$

Together with the Künneth formula this gives

$$H_k(B\Gamma) = \bigoplus_{p_1 + \cdots + p_5 = k} H_{p_1}(X_1) \otimes \cdots \otimes H_{p_4}(X_4) \otimes H_{p_5}(X_5) \ .$$

Here we have written $\mathbb{T}^4 = X_1 \times \cdots \times X_4$ as product of four copies of $\mathbb{T}$, and X_5 for $B\mathbb{Z}/3$.

Fix a basepoint $x = (x_1, \ldots, x_5) \in B\Gamma$ and let $p\colon \mathbb{T} \to B\mathbb{Z}/3$ be a map which indudes an epimorphism on π_1 as in [4], as well as $f_j\colon X_j \to B\Gamma$ the map which includes X_j identically and basepoint-preserving. We denote by $[*] \in H_0(B\Gamma)$ the canonical generator. Next, choose for each $1 \leq j \leq 4$ generators $g_j \in H_1(X_j)$ and elements $g_j^* \in H^1(X_j)$ with $\langle g_j^*, g_j \rangle = 1$, and let $g_5 \in H_1(X_5)$ be $p_*[\mathbb{T}]$ where $[\mathbb{T}]$ is the standard generator for $H_1(\mathbb{T})$. Introduce the elements $v_j := (f_j)_*(g_j) \in H_1(B\Gamma)$ for $j = 1, \dots, 5$ as well as $a_1, \dots, a_4 \in H^1(B\Gamma)$ with

$$\begin{aligned} a_1 &:= (\mathrm{pr}_1)^*(g_1^*) \times 1 \times 1 \times 1 \times 1 \ , \\ a_2 &:= 1 \times (\mathrm{pr}_2)^*(g_2^*) \times 1 \times 1 \times 1 \ , \\ a_3 &:= 1 \times 1 \times (\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3^*) \times 1 \times 1 \ , \\ a_4 &:= 1 \times 1 \times 1 \times (\mathrm{pr}_4)^*(g_4^*) \times 1 \ . \end{aligned}$$

Finally, set

$$w := v_1 \times \cdots \times v_4 \times v_5 \in H_5(B\Gamma)$$

and

$$z := [*] \times [*] \times [*] \times v_4 \times v_5 \in H_2(B\Gamma) \ .$$

By the Künneth formula, $w \neq 0$ and $z \neq 0$. Furthermore,

$$z = a_1 \cap (a_2 \cap (a_3 \cap w)) \in H_2(B\Gamma) \ . \qquad (*)$$

For example one has

$$\begin{aligned} a_3 \cap w &= \big(\big(1 \times 1 \times (\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3^*)\big) \times \big(1 \times 1\big)\big) \cap \big(\big(v_1 \times v_2 \times v_3\big) \times \big(v_4 \times v_5\big)\big) \\ &= \big(\big(1 \times 1 \times (\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3^*)\big) \cap \big(v_1 \times v_2 \times v_3\big)\big) \times \big((1 \times 1) \cap (v_4 \times v_5)\big) \\ &= \big(\big(1 \cap v_1\big) \times \big(1 \cap v_2\big) \times \big((\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3)^* \cap v_3\big)\big) \times \big(\big(1 \cap v_4\big) \times \big(1 \cap v_5\big)\big) \\ &= v_1 \times v_2 \times \big((\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3^*) \cap v_3\big) \times v_4 \times v_5 \\ &= v_1 \times v_2 \times [*] \times v_4 \times v_5 \ , \end{aligned}$$

because of $(\mathrm{pr}_3)^*(g_3^*) \cap (i_3)_*(g_3) = \langle g_3^*, g_3 \rangle [*]$. Let $f\colon \mathbb{T}^5 \to \mathbb{T}^4 \times B\mathbb{Z}/3$ be given by $f = (f_1 \times f_2 \times f_3 \times f_4) \times (f_5 \circ p)$ and choose $(g_1 \times \cdots \times g_4) \times [\mathbb{T}] =: [\mathbb{T}^5]$ as fundamental class for $\mathbb{T}^5$. Then $f_*[\mathbb{T}^5] = w$. As in [4] one can construct a bordism in $\Omega_5^{\mathrm{spin}}(B\Gamma)$ from f to a map $g\colon M \to B\Gamma$ which induces an isomorphism on π_1-level. This defines the manifold M. Now let N be any simply-connected closed non-spin manifold of dimension 5 and set $X := M \# N$.

Finally, assume that X admits a metric of positive scalar curvature. Then consider the map $h\colon M \sqcup N \to B\Gamma$ on the disjoint union of M and N, which equals g on M and sends N to a point. One has $h_*[M \sqcup N] = g_*[M] = w$ and since $M \sqcup N$ is bordant to $M \# N$, it follows that $w \in H_5^+(X)$. But then it follows from $(*)$ as well as Lemma 1.1 that w is mapped to z under the following map

$$\begin{aligned} H_5^+(B\Gamma) &\xrightarrow{a_3 \cap} H_4^+(B\Gamma) \\ &\xrightarrow{a_2 \cap} H_3^+(B\Gamma) \\ &\xrightarrow{a_1 \cap} H_2^+(B\Gamma) \ . \end{aligned}$$

Hence $z = k_*[S^2]$ for some $k\colon S^2 \to B\Gamma$ since S^2 is the only orientable surface which admits a metric of positive scalar curvature. On the other hand, $\pi_2(B\Gamma) = 0$ so that k is null homotopic. This implies $z = 0$, which is a contradiction. ☐

References

[1] Stanley Chang. Positive scalar curvature of totally nonspin manifolds. *Proc. Amer. Math. Soc.*, 138(5):1621–1632, 2010.

[2] Michael Joachim and Thomas Schick. Positive and negative results concerning the Gromov-Lawson-Rosenberg conjecture. In *Geometry and topology: Aarhus (1998)*, volume 258 of *Contemp. Math.*, pages 213–226. Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, RI, 2000.

[3] Daniel Pape. *Index theory and positive scalar curvature*. PhD thesis, Georg-August-Universität of Göttingen, 2011.

[4] Thomas Schick. A counterexample to the (unstable) Gromov-Lawson-Rosenberg conjecture. *Topology*, 37(6):1165–1168, 1998.